

WEDNESDAY, 20 JULY 2016

**TO: ALL MEMBERS OF THE EXECUTIVE BOARD**

I HEREBY SUMMON YOU TO ATTEND A MEETING OF THE **EXECUTIVE BOARD** WHICH WILL BE HELD IN THE **CHAMBER, COUNTY HALL, CARMARTHEN, CARMARTHEN AT 10.00 AM. ON TUESDAY, 26TH JULY, 2016** FOR THE TRANSACTION OF THE BUSINESS OUTLINED ON THE ATTACHED AGENDA

*Mark James*

**CHIEF EXECUTIVE**



PLEASE RECYCLE

Democratic Officer:	Michelle Evans Thomas
Telephone (direct line):	01267 224470
Fax:	(01267) 224911
E-Mail:	MEEvansThomas@carmarthenshire.gov.uk
Ref:	AD016-001

# EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBERSHIP 10 MEMBERS

Councillor	Portfolio
<b>Councillor Emlyn Dole</b>	<b>Leader (Plaid Cymru)</b> Corporate Leadership and Strategy; Chair of Executive Board; Represents Council at WLGA; Political Advocate for Council; Appoints Executive Board Members; Determines EBM Portfolios; Liaises with Chief Executive
<b>Councillor David Jenkins</b>	<b>Deputy Leader - Resources (Plaid Cymru)</b> Finance & Budget; ICT; Property / Asset Management; Procurement; Housing Benefits; Revenues; Armed Forces Champion; and Chairs Executive Board in Leader's absence
<b>Councillor Pam Palmer</b>	<b>Deputy Leader - Communities (Independent)</b> Council Business Manager; Community Champion; Customer Focus & Policy, Police Liaison; Community Safety; Social Justice / Crime & Disorder Community Planning; Anti-Poverty Champion; Sustainability; Bio-diversity; Youth Ambassador; Rural Affairs and Chairs Executive Board in Leader's absence
<b>Councillor Hazel Evans</b>	<b>Technical Services (Plaid Cymru)</b> Refuse; Street Cleansing; Transport Services; Grounds Maintenance; Building Services; Catering Services; Caretaking; Building Cleaning; Transport Services; Emergency Planning; Flooding
<b>Councillor Linda Evans</b>	<b>Housing (Plaid Cymru)</b> Housing – Public; Housing – Private; Equalities; Older People
<b>Councillor Meryl Gravell</b>	<b>Regeneration &amp; Leisure (Independent)</b> Economic Development; West Wales European Centre; Community Development; Sports; Leisure Centres; Museums; Libraries; Country Park
<b>Councillor Gareth Jones</b>	<b>Education and Children (Plaid Cymru)</b> Schools; Children Services; Special Education Needs; Safeguarding; Respite Homes; Regional Integrated School Improvement Service; Adult Community Learning; Youth Services; Lead Member for Children and Young People; Eisteddfod Ambassador
<b>Councillor Jim Jones</b>	<b>Environmental &amp; Public Protection (Independent)</b> Environmental Enforcement; Litter; Unlicensed Waste; Dog Fouling; Parking Services; Trading Standards; Environmental Health.
<b>Councillor Mair Stephens</b>	<b>Human Resources, Efficiencies &amp; Collaboration (Independent)</b> Human Resources; Training; Simpson Compact; Priority Based Budgeting (PPB); Corporate Efficiencies; Welsh Language Champion; Town and Community Councils Ambassador.
<b>Councillor Jane Tremlett</b>	<b>Social Care &amp; Health (Independent)</b> Adult Social Services; Residential Care; Home Care; Learning Disabilities; Mental Health; NHS Liaison/Collaboration/ Integration; Carers' Champion; Disability Ambassador; Dementia Care Champion; 50+ Champion.

# AGENDA

1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE.
2. DECLARATIONS OF PERSONAL INTEREST.
3. TO SIGN AS A CORRECT RECORD THE MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE EXECUTIVE BOARD HELD ON THE FOLLOWING DATES:-
  - 3 .1 20TH JUNE, 2016; 21 - 34
  - 3 .2 4TH JULY, 2016. 35 - 40
4. QUESTIONS ON NOTICE BY MEMBERS (NONE RECEIVED).
5. PUBLIC QUESTIONS ON NOTICE
  - 5 .1 QUESTION BY MRS KAREN HUGHES TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN

*“There have been a number of failures on the consultation process with the headmaster admitting on the 26th April that they had been naive about the consultation process. We have received correspondence confirming the school were aware of a proposal from the LEA in September 2014, followed by a proposal letter in January 2015 to the school which makes reference to 5 issues which were agreed as a package which had to be taken as a whole. With the insistence that the package must be accepted by the governors and LEA as a whole and already accepted in February 2015 it does make us wonder if this was already a ‘done deal’. Why wasn’t this made public to all stakeholders in September 2014 showing openness and transparency?”*

- 5 .2 QUESTION BY MR STEVE HATTO TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN

*“We have exchanged extensive correspondence with CCC with one subject concerning safety risks involved when transporting pupils to alternative English Medium Schools. One of the main concerns is that families who are unable to drive would have to walk with small children in all weather conditions over 2 miles depending on where in Llangennech they live. They would have to cross a busy 40 mph road and three motorway slip roads to reach their designated school. However, LEAs outlook*

*on this states: that it is parental choice not to enrol our children at Llangennech and therefore it is parental responsibility to transport their children to other schools. However, the English Medium is being withdrawn by the Local Education Authority. It is not parent's choice to remove children from Llangennech but is a course of action forced upon us to take our children to a suitable English Medium. Not every child is able to learn through the medium of Welsh due to various reasons. However, there are 170 surplus Welsh medium places available in the local area at Brynsierfel and Furnace. But the three alternative English medium schools Bryn, Bynea and Hendy are already over capacity. No regard has been given to the 91 houses being built in Hendy, the 700 plus houses planned for Pontardulais and also in Bynea. Surely this would have a major impact on the surrounding schools. Currently any family in Llangennech speaking either welsh or English can have their child taught in either of the official languages of wales. Is it not the case that this choice of education at the local school is being removed and people requiring their child to be educated in one of the official languages will be discriminated against... If the English Medium is removed can you please explain how is this parental choice? And where will you provide alternative English Medium Education for our children?"*

**5.3 QUESTION BY MS JULIA REES TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN**

*"From the information supplied by the LEA, it is clearly evident that the figures have been manipulated by individuals to bolster a particular scenario. There are 121 pupils in the school that do not live in Llangennech. But there are 96 children from the village travelling to other schools out of the area. 81 of them are attending an alternative English medium school. If the 81 children could attend their community school, the figures would then show more of a 50/50 demand for English and Welsh in the community of Llangennech. Parents who sought English medium education in the past at Llangennech have been turned away because the school was full. But this wasn't the case, as some parents proved during a tribunal, and who were then offered a place at Ysgol Llangennech. Why were English medium places refused when the capacity for English medium was half the capacity of Welsh classes? How can the school publicise its green credentials when it will support transporting a large number of pupils into and out of the village?"*

**5.4 QUESTION BY MRS MICHAELA BEDDOWS TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN**

*“Special Educational Needs: No consideration has been given for children with special educational needs who are usually advised to only go in an English medium stream or the language of their home environment .Children with global delay struggle with one language let alone two, therefore by removing the dual stream it would exclude these children from attending the school. Children with an Autistic Spectrum Disorder really cannot cope with change in routine, so if they were to start then struggle in a Welsh Medium school and then have to move to an English Medium school that change would have a massive impact on them. Many children with learning difficulties, especially ASD feel very isolated even in a supported environment. If they were made to attend a school out of the area this would isolate them further from the community as a whole. How has this been overlooked and why has it not been addressed?”*

**5.5 QUESTION BY MR KARL HARRIES TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN**

*“I am a parent of 3 former pupils and grandfather of two current pupils at Llangennech School, one of whom was nonverbal at age 4 and has learning disabilities. All of my children attended Llangennech School through the Welsh medium. My wife and I being non Welsh speakers watched them struggle and were unable to help them. This left us with a feeling of helplessness that we would not wish upon any parent let alone a parent of a child with learning disabilities. This in itself is a very stressful and demanding task without the addition of a language barrier. I would like to ask if actual proof and not conjecture and the constant use of the word belief can be provided in order to substantiate claims which state that Welsh medium education is as successful if not more successful than English medium education for children who have a learning disability? With emphasis placed upon children with significant learning disabilities, nonverbal children and moreover children with disabilities from non Welsh speaking homes.”*

**5.6 QUESTION BY MR DARREN SEWARD TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN**

*“You have stated that as an Authority you are endeavouring to*

*increase the number of bilingual pupils within Carmarthenshire and have developed a policy in order to delivery this strategy.*

*We contacted Mr. Sully on the 29th June requesting information as to which schools had already gone through this process prior to Llangennech and which were the ones programmed to follow the initiative after Llangennech. In his response Mr. Sully stated that, I quote, 'The situation at other schools has no bearing on the proposal for Llangennech'*

*Can you please outline that the imposition of Welsh Medium education at Llangennech is part of a wider policy strategy being pursued by the Authority?"*

**5.7 QUESTION BY MS NIKKI LLOYD TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN**

Change for a community or organisation is generally seen as a good thing. Change for change sake is seen as counter-productive. Change based on no demand is to be avoided at all costs. Following a recent FOI request regarding the supply and demand of Welsh books within the library at Llangennech we have been advised the following.

English Books 5,186 stocked - 13,909 lent within the year = over twice the demand of stock.

Welsh Books 531 stocked 10% of English Stock - 414 lent within the year = under demand on availability.

Total books lent = 14,440 Welsh lent = 2.8% of all books

From this relatively simple piece of research that not only are you attempting to socially engineer a change within the school but through your actions are attempting to socially engineer a community which has no demand or leaning towards a pure Welsh approach. Do you agree?"

**5.8 QUESTION BY MR NIGEL HUGHES TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN**

*"Parents have been subjected to many contradictions regarding the languages taught in reception classes leaving them confused and distressed at the impact this situation might be having on their children.*

*Gareth Jones has recently made a statement refuting the*

*claims that 'Llangennech Infant's School has acted illegally in terms of language provision in the foundation phase.'*

*He goes onto state that 'The County wishes to reassure all parents that this allegation is completely untrue. Provision at the school is entirely appropriate and the school wishes to preform to high standards with pupils achieving good outcomes.'*

*It is interesting to note that this statement does not actually elucidate anything...but adds to the confusion.*

*Mr Rob Sully stated in the Scrutiny meeting of the 23rd May 2015 that Reception Classes were Welsh, but teachers at the new parents meeting held a couple of weeks ago were told it is taught in English Welsh English.*

*Carmarthenshire County Council have also stated that reception class are welsh learning to some parents who have contacted them. The children's homework and reading books are completely in welsh.*

*We are concerned that figures have been engineered and English Stream was not naturally declining but hurdles placed in parent's way to achieve the Welsh Medium goal. Were the Local Authority aware about the false information being provided to parents about the reception classes and the differing views and also confirm the date it changed to Welsh, who proposed it and how was it communicated to affected persons such as parents?"*

**5.9 QUESTION BY MS KAZ DEACON TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN**

*"On page 28 of the Consultation document it shows all children within Derbyn 1 and Derbyn 2 classes of Llangennech Infant School are in Welsh medium, please can you confirm the exact date the language category changed from bilingual to Welsh medium for these classes?"*

**5.10 QUESTION BY MR ROBERT WILLOCK TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN**

*"On the programme week in week out Councillor Campbell said and I quote" Research shows over many years when you provide choice the numbers of welsh medium decreases. So you have a dilemma if you provide choice fewer people opt for*

*various reasons but with a level of compulsion you are giving young people those opportunities to be bilingual. Even though this level of compulsion of lack of choice contravenes article 2 of the first protocol to the European convention on human rights. Do you agree with Councillor Campbell's remarks?"*

**5.11 QUESTION BY MR DEAN BOLGIANI TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN**

*"Following on from the potential benefits of bilingualism which have been highlighted such as health and educational achievements but Llangennech is a green flagged, bilingual school. Surely the local authorities' efforts should be focused upon increasing Welsh within English Medium schools and possibly making them Dual Stream. This would increase and promote bilingualism in its truer sense whilst also giving parents increased choices. This type of strategy would capture a larger percentage of the Carmarthenshire school population and is a unifying approach as opposed to divisive. Can you explain why Llangennech is being targeted under new policy?"*

**5.12 QUESTION BY MS OLRA WILLIAMS TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN**

*"International studies have shown that only inclusive equal status of dual languages actually increase use of both languages into young adulthood. Current CCC and WG policy of excluding non-Welsh speaking families is not cost effective and does not positively promote the Welsh language. Are the Council aware that a high percentage of those leaving the dual English and Welsh stream in Llangennech go on to do well at GCSE Welsh and continue studying Welsh or chosen subjects through the medium of Welsh in Bryngwyn and Coleg Sir Gar?"*

**5.13 QUESTION BY MS SARAH MARTIN TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN**

*"On P138 of the consultation report the summary/conclusion from Estyn's states "In Estyn's opinion, the proposal to merge the two schools is likely to maintain the current educational standards. However, the proposal does not provide sufficient detail about the alternative options and arrangements available to those pupils who may choose to follow their education through the medium of English should the English stream at Llangennech close". The report time and time again cites it will*



*be a parent's choice to send the child elsewhere yet there will be no coverage of cost and alternative English provision is deemed to be full. The local government response to Estyn on p140 also concurs stating "...the proposer does not give sufficient consideration to the effect of ending English medium provision on the pupils who may wish to follow their education through their medium of English". Although current students are considered what viable alternatives are there for future students who do not wish to follow a Welsh education and how can the council justify a proposal that is not backed by both Estyn and local government?"*

**5.14 QUESTION BY MRS LAURA PEARCE TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN**

*"During the last meeting it was clear that the committee / chair understands the many benefits of bilingualism from an early age and how a dual stream school offers this and indeed this was repeatedly referred to. To be very clear, Llangennech School is currently a dual stream school offering bilingualism to children from both English and Welsh families locally in a close knit community. Three of my children have been through or are in the English stream and 2 are in the Welsh stream, this choice has been fundamentally important depending on them as individuals (none have special needs). My question regarding this is quite simply, how can it possibly be a benefit to remove one language (The English language) from a dual stream (bilingual) school - how is one language (Welsh) better than two (Welsh and English) when the very essence of bilingualism is 2 languages?"*

**5.15 QUESTION BY MRS MAUREEN JONES TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN**

*"I am a former pupil of Ysgol Llangennech, my sisters, my daughter, my grandchildren and great grandchildren have attended, or are currently attending Llangennech schools.*

*Could I please ask why, after over 60 years of successful bilingual education taught through the medium of English and Welsh, many years of excellent reports, and a proven record, that Carmarthenshire County Council feels the need to split a close community, with the school at its heart, and alienate those who choose, often for social, personal, or disability reasons, English medium education for their children, and promote single stream education."*

**5.16 QUESTION BY MS SALLY ANN THOMAS TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN**

*“In this climate of austerity, cutbacks and uncertainty, why is CCC spending so much time, money and valuable resources on FIXING a school that is NOT BROKEN? Llangennech is a very successful green, bilingual, dual stream school, whose motto is "Education for ALL". Wouldn't this valuable money and resources be better spent on yellow and amber English medium schools to strive for them to achieve a high standard of bilingual dual stream education like Llangennech?”*

**5.17 QUESTION BY MRS EMMA LOMAS TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN**

*“Following the report provided by Carmarthenshire County Council regarding the responses from the consultation process we have been approached by several parents stating that their proforma's were not included in the document, even though they had been submitted and receipts received. From the responses received it would appear that there is strong support for keeping the dual stream with a total of 154 recognised responses as well as a signed petition of 505 signatories (which has already been submitted). The against group have been open in sharing their names and relationship to the school whilst the for campaigners have continued with the clandestine approach of not wishing to be named with over 30 anonymous entries. Many of the pro change consultees were past teachers, councillors, head teachers and current staff. It was suggested that the responses were relatively equal with for and against. The total number of those against compared to those for is a ratio of 5:1. How is this considered to be equal when the consultees for supporting the change do not appear to include many parental opinions and a vast number of those against the change do not appear to have been included?”*

**5.18 QUESTION BY MRS JACQUELINE SEWARD TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN**

*“It is acknowledged that the Welsh Assembly led by the Labour*

*Government has set out a vision to increase the Welsh language in Wales across various aspects of life. The Assembly has confirmed in writing that no targets have been given regarding the Welsh language so how this is implemented is at the discretion of each Local Authority. For example, the Counties of South Wales such as Neath Port Talbot, Swansea, Cardiff each have a Welsh in Education Strategic Plan that aim to increase Welsh without using authoritarian approaches. We are not aware of any headline deliverables within any political manifesto to forcibly change the existing language choices at primary schools within the County without consideration for the preferences of choice of parents and the community being taken into account. Can you please advise under what mandate and promises made to the electorate by members is this initiative is being undertaken?"*

**5.19 QUESTION BY MRS KATE WARNER TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN**

*"In complying with the Schools Standards & Organisation Wales Act (2013), the Welsh Government directed every Local Education Authority in Wales to produce a 'Welsh in Education Strategic Plan' to implement its policy of expanding Welsh medium education. Carmarthenshire County Council complied with the Government's directive and produced the Welsh in Education Strategic Plan which was approved by the Welsh Government. If the proposal for Llangennech School is not implemented, surely the Council would not be then complying with the Welsh Government's approved 'Welsh in Education Strategic Plan' for Carmarthenshire. Is this interpretation correct?"*

**5.20 QUESTION BY MRS ELIN GRIFFITHS TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN**

*"Bilingualism offers many benefits and research shows that children who understand more than one language have the ability to think more flexibly and creatively. Two languages can offer economic benefits when searching for a job in the future, it enables communication with a wider range of people, the ability to experience two different cultures and gives people the opportunity to be part of all aspects of social life. Does the Executive Board agree that no child should be at a disadvantage, educationally, socially or economically, therefore by agreeing that Llangennech Infant and Junior schools continue along the language continuum, assurance will be*

*given that each child will enjoy the same benefits?”*

**5 .21 QUESTION BY MR OWAIN GLENISTER TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN**

*“Considering the pressure on Carmarthenshire County Council to respond to the Welsh Language Measure 2011, i.e. to provide basic services through both languages, does the Executive Board consider that developing individuals with the ability to communicate effectively in two languages is essential as a long term strategy when trying to develop a workforce that can provide services through the medium of Welsh and English. If so, do you feel that this change to Ysgol Llangennech will give children better opportunities to develop into bilingual adults, and therefore more likely to secure a post in the public sector?”*

**5 .22 QUESTION BY MRS HELEN MAINWARING TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN**

*“As Labour was leading the Council when the 'Welsh in Education Strategic Plan 2014-2017' was announced in 2013, which stated the intention to change dual stream schools into Welsh schools, does the Labour Party's commitment to this policy remain the same, and can we have the same assurance, now that the Leadership of the Council has changed, that this Strategic Plan will continue to have the support of the Councillors and be implemented in the same way?”*

**5 .23 QUESTION BY MR HYWEL DAVIES TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN**

*“Are members of the Executive Board aware of the fact that the Assembly has a cross-party commitment to create a bilingual Wales and that employers are increasingly looking for bilingual skills as recent legislation insists that public bodies must provide services in the language choice of the customer?”*

**5 .24 QUESTION BY MRS CATHRIN JONES TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN**

*“Have members of the Executive Board read the recent*

*research in Canada that proves that bilingualism can have a positive impact on the brain in later life by keeping it alert and helping to reduce the possibility of suffering dementia?"*

**5 .25 QUESTION BY MR MARTYN WILLIAMS TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN**

*"In Welsh medium and Dual stream schools, there is a specific emphasis on developing Welsh through immersion methods across all areas of learning of the Foundation Phase, whatever language the child speaks at home. The 'Welsh in the Foundation Phase' report by Estyn published in December 2013 states "that the standards in pupils' language, literacy and communication skills are similar to those in English-medium schools and settings, and are line with the expected level at that age". Therefore does the Executive Board agree that Welsh in the Foundation Phase is successful in providing children from Welsh speaking homes and English speaking homes the best start in their education?"*

**5 .26 QUESTION BY MR MICHAEL REES TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN**

*"As a retired primary school teacher in Carmarthenshire with my final post as a Deputy Head Teacher in a Llanelli school, I would like to ask a question about the strength of a Welsh language education. My wife and I were both brought up in entirely English speaking homes, however, we decided to send our children through Welsh medium education. As English speakers we as parents experienced no problems with our childrens' homework, rather the opposite as it enhanced our knowledge and understanding. During my years in teaching, I did experience teaching in dual stream schools. I have seen at first hand that teaching Welsh as a second language in dual or English medium schools is an overall failure and that dual streams do dilute the Welsh language as is so evident on the playground. Does the Executive Board agree with my observations that the most effective education to produce totally fluent bilingual children - speaking, reading and writing in English and Welsh is a Welsh language medium education?"*

**5 .27 QUESTION BY MRS RHIANEDD REES TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN**

*"Between 2000 and 2006, the number of children at Ysgol y*

*Ffwrnes had doubled and as a result of this, and other reasons, a new school was built to ensure that there were sufficient places, according to the projections, for the naturally increasing demand by parents for Welsh medium education in the Llanelli area. As these extended early years classes at Ysgol Ffwrnes are full or close to being full for September 2016, does the Executive Board agree that this concrete evidence is the only way to ensure that this continued demand for Welsh medium education in the Llanelli area, which ensures that children leave primary school bilingual, is to ensure that Llangennech Infant and Junior schools continue along the language continuum and change to a Welsh medium school?"*

**5 .28 QUESTION BY MRS MANON WILLIAMS TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN**

*"Ysgol Dewi Sant, the first Welsh medium school in Wales to be adopted by the local authority, was opened in 1947. Since then, Welsh medium education has expanded considerably in Wales in general, not as a result of promotion by local authorities, but mainly due to increasing demand by parents, as seen in Llangennech schools. Today, there are over 387 Welsh medium primary schools in Wales and this continues to increase gradually, at the same time the percentage of primary school aged children who received Welsh medium education increased from 18.8% in 2000/01 to 24% in 2014/15. Considering the success and the benefits of this type of teaching and bilingualism in general, which have been recognised world wide, will this Council now consider backing up the wisdom and far-sightedness of parents by actively promoting and marketing Welsh medium education?"*

**5 .29 QUESTION BY MRS SIAN LLOYD TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN**

*"Does the Executive Board agree with me that national data published over recent years by the Welsh Government and Carmarthenshire Education Authority shows clearly that pupils from Welsh schools or streams perform better in external tests and assessments in core subjects (including English as a subject) than pupils in English medium schools or streams, which shows that Welsh medium schools have clear educational benefits?"*

**5 .30 QUESTION BY MR CURTIS ROBERTS TO COUNCILLOR GARETH JONES, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN**

*“Can the Executive Board confirm, on the basis of their long term experience of introducing the Welsh language to children with special educational needs, with many having come from non-Welsh speaking homes, that this hasn’t had any negative effect on their education or development as individuals?”*

**6. QUESTIONS REFERRED TO THE EXECUTIVE BOARD BY THE EDUCATION & CHILDREN SCRUTINY COMMITTEE:-**

**6 .1 QUESTION BY MR DARREN SEWARD**

*“Carmarthenshire County Council has produced a document describing its proposal to CLOSE/DISCONTINUE Llangennech Infants and Llangennech Juniors school and open a new Welsh Medium only Llangennech community primary school. Why is CCC pushing the Welsh assembly directives on Welsh language so far when it is not happening in other counties like Swansea, Neath, Port Talbot and Newport?”*

**6 .2 QUESTION BY NIKKI LLOYD**

*“There are 121 pupils currently in the School who are not living in the village of Llangennech. However, there are 96 children living in the village travelling to other schools, out of area. Only 15 of those children are attending Welsh medium so that leaves 81 attending alternative English medium. Why such a differentiation? Some of these could have had places in Llangennech but have been turned away making the English stream look as if it is declining.”*

**6 .3 QUESTION BY NIKKI LLOYD**

*“We have already had one parent that we know of refused a place in Bryn due to 54 requests for only 30 places. Hendy is full also, where are you going to provide provision for parents who want or NEED to educate their children in English medium?”*

**6 .4 QUESTION BY ROBERT WILLOCK**

*“Out of the 121 children currently in the school 91 are attending Welsh medium. Why is this so when the new Furnace school is*

*under capacity by 132 places and Brynserfiel under by 38.5 Pupils according to section 2.3 of the consultation document. There's surplus capacity at Welsh Mediums which is not in alignment with School Organisation Code 2013 which states no more than a 10% surplus. There are 1,710 as per Carmarthenshire Councils website surplus places in all Welsh medium primary schools in Carmarthenshire figures taken from CCC own website. So doesn't justify any further spaces being created. The School Organisation code 2013 states when developing proposals relevant bodies should have regard to Local plans for economic or housing development. Why has there been no regard given to the 91 houses being built in Hendy and 700 plus houses planned for Pontardulais? Surely, this would have a major impact on the surrounding schools. Hendy is one of the nearest schools for English medium if this proposal goes through. However, Llanedi school is facing closure and advised to relocate to Hendy. Hendy school are already nearing full capacity and as a dual stream are earmarked for changing to Welsh Medium Only. The other nearest English medium is the Bryn School but the county have already been issuing reject letters as they have received 54 applications so far and only have 30 spaces. As well as the proposed new school being unfit for purpose as it does not serve the community it's meant to support, English speaking children appear to have no nearby alternatives?"*

#### **6.5 QUESTION BY JACQUELINE SEWARD**

*"Following the closure of a school and the consequential loss of a language stream, provision should be offered to at least equivalent standards to learners according to the School Organisation Code 2013. However, Llangennech is currently Green. Hendy is yellow and the Bryn is Amber. How is this equivalent?"*

#### **6.6 QUESTION BY NIGEL HUGHES**

*"The consultation document is a flawed document that does not recognise those disadvantaged by the proposals from within Llangennech village. To state that there is nobody affected by these proposed changes is naïve and ignorant and shows that the Authority has failed to show 'due regard' under the Public Duty Act to those affected by simply saying they don't exist. In doing so, they have not covered the Health and Safety aspects or capacity issues at alternative schools. If walking to Hendy for example, crossing a dual carriageway, will put lives at risk. There is a CrashMap available online which shows along that particular route, one accident occurring every 2 months on average. Therefore, this consultation*



*simply exposes a rush to a predetermined outcome irrespective of any views that were to be gathered throughout the process. We believe that we can evidence the fact that either the LEA or the governing body or both have failed to comply with The School Organisational Code 2013 and possibly the law. Do you think this is acceptable to put young children at risk daily?"*

#### **6.7 QUESTION BY DARREN SEWARD**

*"Is there need for additional nursery places in the area when we already have two providers? Specific factors need to be taken into account for proposals to add or remove nursery classes as outline in the School Organisation Code 2013. Relevant bodies should take into account specific factors: the standard of nursery education and the sufficiency of accommodation and facilities offered both in the classroom and outdoors, and the viability of any school that wishes to add nursery places; whether there is a need for additional nursery places in the area; the levels of demand for certain types of nursery education e.g. Welsh medium or provision with a religious character; the effect of the proposals on other institutions, including private and third sector providers; and the extent to which proposals will integrate early years education with childcare services or are consistent with an integrated approach. Within the consultation document, there is no evidence that these have been taken into consideration and the effect of the proposals on other private sector providers?"*

#### **6.8 QUESTION BY MICHAELA BEDDOWS**

*"Special Educational Needs: No consideration has been given for children with special educational needs who are usually advised to only go in an English medium Stream or the language of their home environment. Children with global delay struggle with one language let alone two, therefore by removing the dual stream it would exclude these children from attending the school. Children with an Autistic Spectrum Disorder really can't cope with change in routine, so if they were to start then struggle in a Welsh Medium school and then have to move to an English Medium school that change would have a massive impact on them. How has this been overlooked and why has it not been addressed?"*

#### **6.9 QUESTION BY STEVE HATTO**

*"Figures manipulated – From the information supplied by the*

*LEA as the groups knowledge of the school it is clearly evident that the figures have been manipulated by individuals to bolster a particular scenario. We can evidence that the current English streams at the school make up over 30% of the total number of pupils. The consultation states Llangennech infant school total pupils in 2015 had 186 in Welsh stream. This is not a true figure as it includes all pupils in Derbyn 1 and 2 which totals 94 pupils, irrelevant of it they are registered to continue into the English stream they have been falsely identified for the purpose of the consultation document as Welsh stream pupils. Also if we factor in the 27% coming from outside areas, together with a potential loss of English Stream, current projections will show that Llangennech School will have over 50% of pupils coming from outside the area. Do you believe, that we then have 'the right school, in the right place and can you confirm if these figures are correct?'*

#### **6 .10 QUESTION BY KAREN HUGHES**

*"There are approximately 11 dual Stream Schools in Carmarthenshire which according to the Welsh Language Strategy, are being earmarked for Welsh Medium only. It must be recognised that not all these schools will be suitable based upon their logistics as they will be dual stream for a reason, so how and who is assessing the demand and suitability? Has an horizon scanning exercise been conducted for Llangennech community i.e to assess how the village/population of Llangennech will look in 5, 10, 15 years time? With an increased number of new builds, an influx in migration, being close to the M4 corridor, can we confidently say that Welsh Medium Only will meet these demands when 80% of the population is already English speaking. After all, 27% of pupils are coming from outside areas and village figures do not show an increase in demand for Welsh. The Welsh Language Strategy Impact has also not been assessed properly if at all. There is no reference to English speakers having less of an appreciation of the cultural heritage of Wales if they attend English Medium only, more people are likely to try the Welsh stream if they know they can fall back to English within the same school. This will have the adverse effect. The use of Welsh within the community is minimal and does not support the linguistic demographics or the stats from the 2011 consensus. Why aren't these risks being factored in?"*

#### **6 .11 QUESTION BY ROBERT WILLOCK**

*"The Community Impact Assessment is not actually an Impact Assessment at all. It has not recognised any risks or risk assessed them (given a positive, negative or neutral rating).*

*One would expect consideration to be given to the impact on neighbouring schools, impact on parents and families, impact on pupils, travel implications, impact of community demographics, environmental impacts, impact upon community activities, impact on residents. These are the areas which are likely to be negatively assessed and have totally been overlooked! Why?"*

<b>7. MODERNISING EDUCATION PROGRAMME - PROPOSAL TO DISCONTINUE LLANGENNECH INFANT SCHOOL AND LLANGENNECH JUNIOR SCHOOL AND ESTABLISH LLANGENNECH COMMUNITY PRIMARY SCHOOL.</b>	41 - 214
<b>8. ENVIRONMENTAL &amp; PUBLIC PROTECTION SCRUTINY COMMITTEE TASK &amp; FINISH GROUP FINAL REPORT 2015/16 - CAR PARKING CHARGES.</b>	215 - 262
<b>9. CARMARTHESHIRE ROAD SAFETY STRATEGY.</b>	263 - 276
<b>10. REVENUE BUDGET OUTLOOK 2017/18 - 2019/20.</b>	277 - 300
<b>11. ANNUAL TREASURY MANAGEMENT AND PRUDENTIAL INDICATOR REPORT 2015/16.</b>	301 - 316
<b>12. SOLAR PHOTOVOLTAIC (PV).</b>	317 - 328
<b>13. PARC HOWARD MASTERPLAN.</b>	329 - 340
<b>14. PEMBREY COUNTRY PARK MASTERPLAN.</b>	341 - 348
<b>15. JAPANESE KNOTWEED AND OTHER INVASIVE NON-NATIVE PLANTS.</b>	349 - 352
<b>16. DRAFT SUPPLEMENTARY PLANNING GUIDANCE - CARMARTHESHIRE LOCAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN.</b>	353 - 378
<b>17. MODEL TIME OFF POLICY FOR SCHOOLS.</b>	379 - 402
<b>18. ANY OTHER ITEMS OF BUSINESS THAT BY REASONS OF SPECIAL CIRCUMSTANCES THE CHAIR DECIDES SHOULD BE CONSIDERED AS A MATTER OF URGENCY PURSUANT TO SECTION 100B(4)(B) OF THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT ACT, 1972.</b>	

19. THE REPORTS RELATING TO THE FOLLOWING ITEMS ARE NOT FOR PUBLICATION AS THEY CONTAIN EXEMPT INFORMATION AS DEFINED IN PARAGRAPH 14 OF PART 4 OF SCHEDULE 12A TO THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT ACT 1972 AS AMENDED BY THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT (ACCESS TO INFORMATION) (VARIATION) (WALES) ORDER 2007. IF, FOLLOWING THE APPLICATION OF THE PUBLIC INTEREST TEST, THE BOARD RESOLVES PURSUANT TO THE ACT TO CONSIDER THESE ITEMS IN PRIVATE, THE PUBLIC WILL BE EXCLUDED FROM THE MEETING DURING SUCH CONSIDERATION.
20. POTENTIAL ACQUISITION OF GUILDHALL, CARMARTHEN. 403 - 410
21. WIND STREET - TIRYDAIL LANE JUNCTION, AMMANFORD - LAND ACQUISITION. 411 - 422
22. PROPOSED NEW PUBLIC CAR PARK - KING STREET, LAUGHARNE. 423 - 428